

**Report on the Accreditation of Study Programmes
at Chernihiv Polytechnic National University
Reference Number I-1792-1**



13th Meeting of the ZEvA Commission on July 6th 2021

Item 4.1.

Study Programme	Degree	Programme Duration	Type of Programme	Maximum annual intake
Economics	Bachelor of Economics	3 years and 10 months	Full-time	94
Tourism	Master of Arts	1 year and 4 months	Full-time	29
Management	Doctor of Philosophy	4 years	Full-time/	7
Economics	Doctor of Philosophy	4 years	Full-time	11

Accreditation contract signed on: 6th August 2019

Date of digital site visit: 25th-26th February 2021

Contact person at the higher education institution: Hanna Dyvnych, cnut.international@gmail.com

ZEvA programme officer: Leonie Pessara, pessara@zeva.org

Expert Panel:

1.) Prof. Dr. Silke Bustamante

Berlin School of Economics and Law

Vice Dean of the Faculty of Cooperative Studies

Course Director Service Management and Professor for Business Administration/Management

2.) Prof. Dr. Rupert Holzapfel

University of Applied Sciences Bremen

International Tourism Economics / International Tourism Management

Head of the International Degree Programme in Tourism Management

3.) Prof. Dr. Helmut Wachowiak

International University of Applied Sciences

Head of Tourism Management Department

4.) Joseph Wimmel (representative of the profession)

Homiro metrology GmbH

Founder, Managing Director

5.) Patrizia Bartzel (students' representative)

Technical University Chemnitz

Master student: Customer Relationship Management (Business Informatics and Marketing)

Hanover, 08 July 2021

Table of Contents

Table of Contents	I-3
I. Final Vote of the Expert Panel and Decision of the Accreditation Commission.....	I-4
1. Decision of the ZEVA Accreditation Commission (July 6 th 2021)	I-4
II. Final Vote of the Expert Panel.....	II-6
1.1 Accreditation with Preconditions.....	II-6
1.2 Economics (Bachelor of Economics).....	II-7
1.3 Tourism (Master of Arts).....	II-8
1.4 Management (Doctor of Philosophy).....	II-8
1.5 Economics (Doctor of Philosophy)	II-9
III. Evaluation Report of the Expert Panel.....	III-1
Introduction: Purpose, Design and Context of the Accreditation Procedure	III-1
1. Governance, Management and Profile of the University	III-2
2. Assessment of the Study Programmes	III-7
2.1 Common Features and Strategic Dimension of the Programmes.....	III-7
2.2 Economics (Bachelor of Economics).....	III-10
2.3 Tourism (Master of Arts).....	III-16
2.4 Management (Doctor of Philosophy).....	III-19
2.5 Economics (Doctor of Philosophy)	III-23
3. Teaching Faculty	III-29
4. Infrastructure, Resources and Student Support	III-31
5. Quality Assurance	III-33
6. Transparency and Public Information	III-35
IV. Appendix.....	IV-1
1. Statement of the University in Response to the Expert Report	IV-1

I. Final Vote of the Expert Panel and Decision of the Accreditation Commission

1. Decision of the ZEvA Accreditation Commission (July 6th 2021)

The ZEvA Commission follows the experts' report and recommendations and takes note of the university's response.

The Commission decides to accredit the following degree programmes offered by Chernihiv Polytechnic National University for a period of six years:

- *Bachelor's programme in Economics (Bachelor of Economics)*
- *Master's programme in Tourism (Master of Arts)*
- *Doctoral programme in Management (Ph.D.)*
- *Doctoral programme in Economics (Ph.D.)*

The accreditation is awarded under the following two pre-conditions:

- *The course handbooks need to be thoroughly revised to adequately reflect the qualification level of the study programmes and the range of competencies acquired by the students. The chosen methods of teaching and assessment must be constructively aligned with the ILOs and should be described as precisely as possible for each course. The language(s) of teaching should also be named in the course description.*
- *CPNU has to develop clear internal standards and guidelines for the design of its student assessment system. These guidelines should be based on the principles of competence-orientation and constructive alignment and should clearly differentiate between the BA, MA and doctoral level. Especially independent problem-solving-skills, critical-analytical skills and deductive thinking need to be more strongly integrated into the assessment scheme of CPNU. In addition, binding internal standards and requirements for MA theses and doctoral theses, which reflect the general standards of the international scientific community for these qualification levels, need to be formulated.*

Upon fulfilment of the pre-conditions, the accreditation period will start and the accreditation certificate will be issued.

Furthermore, the accreditation is awarded under the following conditions:

1. *CPNU must develop a binding policy for the recognition of qualifications acquired in academic and non-academic contexts outside CPNU. The policy must outline the exact recognition procedure as well as the recognition criteria and must adhere to the fundamental principles of the Lisbon Convention (reversal of the burden of proof).*
2. *The questionnaires used for course evaluations need to be re-designed, especially by taking the following measures:*



Final Vote of the Expert Panel and Decision of the Accreditation Commission

1 Decision of the ZEvA Accreditation Commission (July 6th 2021)

- *Asking only for one specific information with each question (avoid double-barrelled questions)*
 - *Assessing whether students feel that they have actually acquired the desired competencies*
 - *Enabling students to express their wishes in an “open-comment” section*
 - *Assessing the actual student workload in each questionnaire*
 - *Introducing a standardized assessment scale (currently, students and graduates can express their level of satisfaction in points, percentages and letters)*
3. *Central documents like the application procedure, admission and examination regulations as well as curricula must be published in English on the university website.*

The conditions have to be fulfilled within 12 months upon awarding of the accreditation, or at any earlier point in time.

This decision is based on the Standards and Guidelines for Quality Assurance in the European Higher Education Area (ESG), the Framework of Qualifications of the European Higher Education Area and the recommendations of the ECTS Users' Guide as referred to in the ZEvA Manual for the External Assessment of Study Programmes.

II. Final Vote of the Expert Panel

1.1 Accreditation with Preconditions

1.1.1 General Preconditions:

- The course handbooks need to be thoroughly revised to adequately reflect the qualification level of the study programmes and the range of competencies acquired by the students. The chosen methods of teaching and assessment must be constructively aligned with the ILOs and should be described as precisely as possible for each course. The language(s) of teaching should also be named in the course description.
- CPNU has to develop clear internal standards and guidelines for the design of its student assessment system. These guidelines should be based on the principles of competence-orientation and constructive alignment and should clearly differentiate between the BA, MA and doctoral level. Especially independent problem-solving-skills, critical-analytical skills and deductive thinking need to be more strongly integrated into the assessment scheme of CPNU. In addition, binding internal standards and requirements for MA theses and doctoral theses, which reflect the general standards of the international scientific community for these qualification levels, need to be formulated.

1.1.2 General Conditions:

- CPNU must develop a binding policy for the recognition of qualifications acquired in academic and non-academic contexts outside CPNU. The policy must outline the exact recognition procedure as well as the recognition criteria and must adhere to the fundamental principles of the Lisbon Convention (reversal of the burden of proof).
- The questionnaires used for course evaluations need to be re-designed, especially by taking the following measures:
 - Asking only for one specific information with each question (avoid double-barrelled questions)
 - Assessing whether students feel that they have actually acquired the desired competencies
 - Enabling students to express their wishes in an “open-comment” section
 - Assessing the actual student workload in each questionnaire
 - Introducing a standardized assessment scale (currently, students and graduates can express their level of satisfaction in points, percentages and letters)
- Central documents like the application procedure, admission and examination regulations as well as curricula must be published in English on the university website.

II Final Vote of the Expert Panel

1 Decision of the ZEVA Accreditation Commission (July 6th 2021)

1.1.3 General Recommendations:

- Pointing out the rights and responsibilities of the student club in official descriptions
- Increasing the number of classes held in English, e.g. by providing special language training for teachers on a larger scale or/and by recruiting additional teaching personnel from abroad
- Increasing the use of international literature and resources
- Providing each department with an annual budget for the subscription to international databases and journals as well as the acquisition of current textbooks and teaching materials
 - Reconsidering the criteria for selecting and purchasing new publications and developing general guidelines for this process
- Making full licences of “Citavi”, “Zotero”, “Endnote” or other literature referencing software available to all academic members at the university
- Using a uniform questionnaire design for course evaluations and graduate surveys
- Ensuring that the results of course evaluations are made known to the students
- Updating the reference literature at course level on an annual basis. This should always be done by the person who designed and/or currently teaches the course, with the support of the quality assurance unit.
- Regularly screening for up-to-date and purpose-built software in the respective fields can contribute to state-of-the-art education (i.e. simulation games, analytical tools, industry applications).

1.2 Economics (Bachelor of Economics)

1.2.1 Recommendations:

- Sharpening the profile of the programme:
 - Orientation towards international standards and literature
 - Focusing more distinctly either on political economy or business economy
 - Strengthening scientific research competencies through the introduction of a final thesis
 - Introducing courses on “ecological/responsible management”, “business ethics” and “cost management” into the obligatory part of the study programme

II Final Vote of the Expert Panel

1 Decision of the ZEvA Accreditation Commission (July 6th 2021)

- Introducing further topics to the obligatory part of the programme such as ecological/responsible management, business ethics and cost management. The course on “start-up training” might in turn become an elective.

1.2.2 Conditions:

- *None*

1.2.3 Recommendation to the ZEvA Commission:

The expert group recommends the accreditation of the Bachelor’s programme in for the duration of six years with the (pre-)conditions listed above.

1.3 Tourism (Master of Arts)

1.3.1 Recommendations:

- Including the phenomena of globalization, information technologies, sustainable development and climate change as current challenges into the curriculum
- With regards to the allocation of credit points, the expert panel recommends awarding credit points for the submission of the Master’s thesis and for its oral defence.

1.3.2 Conditions:

- *None*

1.3.3 Recommendation to the ZEvA Commission:

The expert group recommends the accreditation of the Master’s programme in Tourism for the duration of six years with the (pre-)conditions listed above.

1.4 Management (Doctor of Philosophy)

1.4.1 Recommendations:

- With regards to the allocation of credit points, the expert panel recommends awarding credit points for the submission of the PhD-thesis and for its oral defence.

1.4.2 Conditions:

- *None*



II Final Vote of the Expert Panel

1 Decision of the ZEvA Accreditation Commission (July 6th 2021)

1.4.3 Recommendation to the ZEvA Commission:

The expert group recommends the accreditation of the Ph.D. programme in Management for the duration of six years with the (pre-)conditions listed above.

1.5 Economics (Doctor of Philosophy)

1.5.1 Recommendations:

- Game theory should be included in the curriculum.
- With regards to the allocation of credit points, the expert panel recommends awarding credit points for the submission of the PhD-thesis and for its oral defence.

1.5.2 Conditions:

- *None*

1.5.3 Recommendation to the ZEvA Commission:

The expert group recommends the accreditation of the Ph.D. programme in Economics (Doctor of Philosophy) for the duration of six years with the (pre-)conditions listed above.

III. Evaluation Report of the Expert Panel

Introduction: Purpose, Design and Context of the Accreditation Procedure

It is the purpose of the programme accreditation procedure to assess the quality of the above listed study programmes offered by the Chernihiv Polytechnical National University (CPNU), Chernihiv/Ukraine, against international standards. The assessment is based on as the framework laid out in the “ZEVA Manual for the External Assessment of Study Programmes”. This assessment framework is based on the “Standards and Guidelines for Quality Assurance in the European Higher Education Area (ESG)” (ENQA 2015), the “Framework for Qualifications for the European Higher Education Area” (2005) and the “ECTS Users’ Guide” (European Communities, 2015).

In line with the ESG, the assessment was organized as a peer review procedure, involving an expert panel composed of three university professors, one professional from outside academia and one student.

For the purpose of assessing the quality of the mentioned study programmes, the Chernihiv Polytechnic National University submitted a self-report. Apart from detailed descriptions of the university as a whole, the internal quality assurance system and descriptions of the study programmes to be assessed, the self-report included a number of additional documents, as e.g. quality assurance policies, course catalogues, detailed information about the library, CVs of teaching faculty and sample questionnaires as well as results of course evaluations. All documents were submitted in English.

Due to the travel restrictions imposed by the Corona pandemic, ZEVA and CPNU jointly decided to conduct a virtual site-visit in February 2021. The site visit involved talks with members of the university leadership, the quality assurance staff, the library and campus facilities management as well as teaching faculty, students and graduates of the Chernihiv Polytechnical National University.

The expert panel came to the conclusion that the self-report and the virtual discussions provided sufficient information in order to arrive at a substantiated judgment. An on-site-visit in Chernihiv was unfortunately not possible.

This report is based on the experts’ assessment of the self-report and on the outcomes of the virtual site visit. It will serve as a decision basis for the ZEVA Commission regarding the accreditation of the study programmes. In the case of a positive accreditation decision, ZEVA will award its quality seal to the programmes for a limited time period, after which the university can reapply for accreditation.

The report will be published on the ZEVA website upon finalization.

The experts would like to thank the rector and the university leadership team, the head of quality assurance, the library and campus facilities management team as well as the teaching faculty, students and graduates and employers of CPNU for the open and constructive atmosphere during the virtual site-visit.

1. Governance, Management and Profile of the University

Chernihiv Polytechnic National University (CPNU) was founded in 1960 as “General Technical Faculty”. Between 1999 and 2020, it was known as “Chernihiv National University of Technology”.

The strategic development plan for 2021-2027 mentions the following long-term strategic goal: “the development of a model of a progressive university that integrates European values, principles of sustainable development of society, formation of advanced professional competencies and social development of a personality”.

Since its foundation, the university has continuously expanded its portfolio of study programmes: currently, 45 Bachelor programmes, 44 Master programmes and 12 doctoral programmes are on offer. In the academic year 2019-20, about 7.000 students were enrolled at CPNU.

In total, the number of faculty amounts to about 175 persons, including both full-time and part-time lecturers.

The large majority of CPNU students is recruited from the city of Chernihiv or the surrounding area. Also, most graduates find employment on the local market.

1.1.1 Organizational Structure and Mission of the University

At central level, Chernihiv Polytechnic National University is governed by the Rector. The Rector is supported by five Vice-Rectors who have different areas of responsibility.

Apart from the “General Meeting of Labour Collective”, the Academic Board and the Supervisory Board are of particular importance regarding strategic decisions, the appointment of staff to leading positions and other crucial managerial aspects. The Academic Board consists of the members of the leadership board, the heads of the departments and central administrative units, members of faculty and students. The Academic Board meets on a monthly basis. It has to be composed of at least 75% academic staff and at least 10% students.

The supervisory board consists of representatives of the municipal administration, independent research institutes as well as local and national entrepreneurs that do not directly employ CPNU graduates.

There is also a students’ club whose rights and responsibilities are laid out in several official regulations.

At academic level, there are seven so-called educational scientific institutes with a total of 33 departments responsible for the development and quality assurance of study programmes, for the delivery of courses and for the promotion of research in their particular subject discipline. Each of these units is managed by a head of department. In addition, a centre for retraining and part-time studying, a college of economics and technology and a college of transport and computer technologies are part of the university.

In addition, there are several units responsible for different administrative issues, as for example the accounting office, the educational-scientific information-computing centre and the HR department.

1.1.2 Values and Strategy

In its self-report, CPNU summarizes its basic values as follows:

- “1. Academic freedom and integrity
2. Preserving traditions and aiming at innovations
3. Respect for the dignity of a personality
4. Openness to the society
5. Focus on high quality and results.”

The strategic development plan for the period from 2021-2027 names the following goals:

- “Establishment of the University as a leading, competitive, modern national scientific and educational centre of international level.
- Personal development and professional growth of participants in the educational process, the formation of competencies that determine the competitiveness of graduates in the labour market in Ukraine and the world.
- Development of creative potential of scientific and pedagogical workers of the University.
- Increasing the international prestige of the University, ensuring compliance of educational services with international quality standards.
- Development of an effective management system of the University, modernization of its structure in accordance with the changes of the national system of higher education and in the context of integration into the world space.
- Introduction of the latest information technologies and software in all spheres of the University's activity, integration of the University into the domestic and world information space.”

The academic staff members also emphasized in the digital talks that ecology and sustainability are one of the core goals of the university.

1.1.3 Student Mobility and Internationalisation

As mentioned above, promoting internationalisation and harmonization with international standards is at the top of CPNU's agenda. This applies especially to the realm of research and administrative processes, where action has already been taken in various ways.

Actual mobility rates of students are currently relatively low, but the university is actively involved in a number of joint research projects. According to the self-report, there are currently more than 50 international partner organizations in more than 20 countries. International collaboration is taking place, for instance, in the field of specialist training, in the context of joint conferences and workshops and through participation in international projects.

III Evaluation Report of the Expert Panel

1 Governance, Management and Profile of the University

For example, CPNU is involved in a research project funded by the NATO together with other Higher Education Institutions from Ukraine, Bulgaria and the USA. Research projects in the realm of social work are conducted with partners from Norway, Switzerland, Germany, Georgia and Albania. During the digital talks it was reported that CPNU regularly hosts guest lecturers from Norway.

Memoranda of Understanding have been signed with several universities to foster student and staff mobility. Erasmus+-mobility projects are in place with partner universities in Spain, Slovenia and Latvia. The International Office provides advice and support to students who wish to go abroad. Staff exchange programmes are installed with Latvian, Lithuanian, German and other partners.

The international office is also in charge of recognition procedures. As reported in the digital talks, foreign students come predominantly from Egypt, Nigeria, Pakistan, Azerbaijan, the Baltic states or Belarus. Some study programmes are entirely offered in English and teachers are incentivized to teach in English through additional payments. The recognition of externally absorbed Bachelor programmes is warranted in line with national regulations. Additionally, incoming students have to pass a professional entrance test and a language test in the teaching language of their chosen programme.

Due to the pandemic, new ways of mobility have been implemented and students have the possibility to participate in lectures conducted by partners from Bulgaria, Poland and Georgia.

1.1.4 Equal Opportunities

Equal opportunities for all students of the university are ensured in official regulations.

In order to support students with special needs and to improve the social standard of CPNU in general, the “centre of inclusive education” has been established. The centre provides students with special needs with a passport indicating their psychophysical status and corresponding measures to be taken in order to enable his or her full participation in the educational process. The centre conducts research on the studying conditions, ensures a barrier-free environment and provides information on support and advisory services. Its director has a background in social work and inclusive education.

It was reported that the main campus was equipped with special entrances and that some buildings were equipped with lifts.

Students with care obligations or special educational needs have the possibility to either shift to an “individual” curriculum, allowing for more flexibility in the planning of their study path, or to take an academic leave if necessary.

1.1.5 Experts' Appraisal

From the experts' point of view, the institutional profile and mission of CPNU are clearly defined. The central development goals of the university have been described in sufficient detail

III Evaluation Report of the Expert Panel

1 Governance, Management and Profile of the University

in the self-report and in the university's normative documents and regulations. Apart from a strong focus on the employability of graduates and on co-operative relationships with business and industry, internationalisation plays a particularly important part in the university's vision of quality, i.e. CPNU is noticeably aiming at sharpening its international profile at all levels and across all fields of activity. Numerous measures for the enhancement of internationalisation have already been taken. The panel commends CPNU on its fruitful efforts to foster internationalisation.

As for the organisational structure, all tasks and responsibilities are clearly defined, and all internal stakeholder groups, including students, participate in decision-making processes to a satisfying extent. The panel recommends pointing out the rights and responsibilities of the student club in official descriptions.

The experts were impressed by the high ambition and dedication to the cause of internationalisation displayed by the leadership board, the faculty and staff of CPNU during the virtual discussions. The university should further pursue this path in the years to come.

In spite of all efforts already taken, the experts still see potential for improvement regarding the internationalisation of teaching and learning. Functioning networks, procedures and support structures do already exist, but there is room for further development especially at the level of the study programmes themselves, that is, at the level of curricula and teaching methods. When it comes to the internationalisation of teaching content, the experts commend the university on its plan to offer courses in English in the Bachelor's programme "Economics" and to implement English-taught courses in scientific research at the doctoral level.

The experts recommend further increasing the use of international literature and sources in class. Students of all disciplines should more frequently work with current textbooks and other materials in English. In addition, the number of classes held in English should be increased, e.g., by providing special language training for teachers on a larger scale or/and by recruiting additional teaching personnel from abroad. Especially in the light of the pandemic, the virtual format might enhance international elements in the curricula.

Co-operation with business enterprises is of central importance for the university's educational mission. As part of the process of internationalisation, it would therefore make sense to forge closer cooperative relationships with companies whose activities reach beyond the Ukrainian market. The panel commends the university on its efforts to foster projects in the realm of ecology and sustainable development in the region of Chernihiv.

Regarding international student mobility, the students reported that they felt very well supported and informed by the international office via social media and messenger services. International mobility covers various formats, from one-week excursions to an entire semester abroad in the context of the Erasmus+ programme. Countries such as Spain, Slovenia, Poland and Latvia were mentioned as destinations. Moreover, regular incoming staff from Norwegian partners was widely appreciated by the students.

As a general rule, credits earned abroad seem to be recognized without difficulty. However, to the experts' knowledge there are no binding regulations yet to provide a formal basis and framework at the university for a general recognition practice of cross-crediting externally

III Evaluation Report of the Expert Panel

1 Governance, Management and Profile of the University

earned credits and qualifications. In order to ensure sufficient reliability for students in this context, the panel concludes that CPNU must develop a binding policy for the recognition of qualifications acquired in academic and non-academic contexts outside CPNU. The policy must outline the exact recognition procedure and the recognition criteria and must adhere to the fundamental principles of the Lisbon Convention (reversal of the burden of proof).

The expert panel gained the impression that the research activity of students is sufficiently fostered by CPNU. Students confirmed that they had the opportunity to participate in conferences, both nationally and internationally. Due to the pandemic, these events have more recently taken place in virtual formats.

The experts welcome the efforts taken by CPNU to integrate students with special needs and to ensure equal opportunities for all students. From the composition of the different stakeholder groups during the virtual discussions, the panel concludes that there is a good gender balance among students and staff and that all members of the university actively participate in the development of the university.

2. Assessment of the Study Programmes

2.1 Common Features and Strategic Dimension of the Programmes

2.1.1 Basic Structural Features

As stipulated by the national educational standards of Ukraine, the programmes at Bachelor's level comprise 240 credit points according to the European Credit Transfer System (ECTS). The standard duration of Master's programmes is 90 credit points. For the completion of a doctoral programme, 60 credit points are awarded. One credit point is equivalent to an average workload of 30 hours.

Ministerial standards also determine some elements of the basic curricular structure of the study programmes. Regardless of their chosen specialisation, all undergraduate students must take a number of courses in the Humanities (Philosophy, History and Culture of Ukraine) and Physical Education. These courses are prescribed by educational national standards. In addition to that, fundamental theoretical and application-oriented courses in the core discipline are part of the curriculum in all programmes. Apart from a large number of compulsory courses, students are offered a choice of both general educational and specialised elective subjects. According to the digital interviews, about 30-50 credit points are pre-defined by the state standard for the Bachelor level. The other 190-210 credit points lie in the academic autonomy of CPNU.

Internships are also a standard part of the curriculum. If necessary, the university assists students in finding suitable internship placements, which may take place at home or abroad. The university holds a regular fair, the so-called "Forum of Opportunities", enabling students to network with potential employers. Students must submit reports on their practical training phases to their academic supervisors as a prerequisite for obtaining credit points. There may also be interviews with the responsible tutor at the internship company. The interviewed employers confirmed that interns received a financial remuneration.

In order to receive the degree, all Master's and Ph.D. programmes are to be finished with a final thesis and defence. As mentioned above, all study programmes offered at CPNU are oriented towards employability on the local labour market.

Graduates from other universities may of course also apply directly for the CPNU Master's and doctoral programmes.

2.1.2 Course Catalogues

The university has produced a study plan and course catalogue in English for each programme, which contains extensive information on each course, including the central contents and intended learning outcomes, the estimated student workload, the form of assessment and the teaching methods applied.

2.1.3 Admission and Selection of Students

As a minimum entrance requirement to university, applicants must have completed their general secondary education and – depending on the degree and course applied for – must have undergone additional tests. The selection of students is based on the average grade of the school leaving certificate and the points achieved in the external tests.

In order to be admitted to Master's programmes and doctoral programmes, applicants must take entrance exams in the core discipline and a foreign language exam in English. For the PhD level, applicants must prove that they possess a competence level of B2 in English according to the European Framework of Reference. The selection of students is based on the results of these examinations.

The official admission regulations of CPNU can be downloaded from the university website, where they are available in Ukrainian.

2.1.4 Student Assessment

Different forms of assessment are applied at CPNU. The most common ones are oral exams, written exams, presentations and term papers. The interviewed students confirmed that the type of assessment and the exam date were always communicated by the lecturer at the beginning of the course. Detailed information on the exams and the assessment criteria are also accessible online via Moodle.

In each course, 60% of the final grade depend on the students' performance in class, whereas 40% are defined by the outcome of the final course exam.

In case students do not pass their first examination, they can take a second try with a different examiner. Students also mentioned the concept of "academic debt", which allows students to put their studies on hold temporarily in order to successfully pass a re-sit examination. In case of repeated failure, the student can be examined a third time by a commission composed of several members of the teaching body. For holders of CPNU scholarships, this results in an immediate loss of their entitlement to financial support. If the second re-sit exam is not passed either, expulsion from the study programme is the consequence.

2.1.5 Experts' Appraisal

In principle, the experts consider the course catalogues as very useful instruments to create transparency for students regarding their programmes. The design of the catalogues clearly follows the recommendations of the ECTS Users' Guide.

Nonetheless, the experts find that part of the given information needs to be rendered more precisely, especially regarding the intended learning outcomes, the course content as well as the teaching and assessment methods.

The course descriptions do not always adequately reflect the desired qualification level of the

respective courses or the range of competencies acquired by the students. Hence, the course handbook needs to be thoroughly revised by taking into account the requirements of the Framework of Qualifications for the EHEA as well as the general strategic goals of the university. The language(s) of teaching should also be explicitly stated for each course.

In this context, the chosen methods of teaching and assessment need to undergo a critical revision, too. As a result, a constructive alignment between the chosen forms of assessment, the intended learning outcomes and the teaching and learning activities should become visible in the course catalogues.

By and large, student assessment appears to be transparent, fair and feasible. By request, CPNU provided the experts with translated abstracts of theses, published articles and sample examination questions. From the experts' point of view, these documents confirm the impression already gained from the course descriptions, that CPNU needs to take a more competence-oriented and student-centered approach to teaching and assessment.

Especially independent problem-solving-skills, critical-analytical skills and deductive thinking need to be more clearly integrated into the assessment scheme of CPNU. This is of particular importance with regards to the requirements for Master's and Ph.D. theses. The material submitted to the experts gives reason to believe that the theses do not always meet international standards in terms of quality and academic rigour.

Therefore, the experts conclude that CPNU has to develop clear internal standards and guidelines for the design of its student assessment system. These guidelines should be based on the principles of competence-orientation and constructive alignment and should clearly differentiate between the BA, MA and doctoral level. In addition, binding internal standards and requirements for MA theses and doctoral theses need to be formulated, which reflect generally accepted standards of the international scientific community for the respective qualification levels.

Moreover, the experts highly recommended updating the reference literature in all courses on a regular basis. Current international sources should be integrated into the teaching process in a more systematic way.

In this context, the panel also highly recommends aligning the type of assessment stipulated in the course description for the internships with the actual practice (internship report instead of a written test).

The panel would like to highlight that students receive a financial return for their internships, which is highly appreciated.

The experts regard the admission procedures as fit for purpose and sufficiently transparent. With regards to the internationalisation efforts of CPNU, the expert panel considers it necessary to publish the admission regulations and further basic documents such as the examination regulations in English on the university website (cf. Chapter 6).

2.2 Economics (Bachelor of Economics)

The Bachelor's programme "Economics" was introduced at CPNU in 2016. It was updated in 2019 according to national legislative standards.

The programme is described as practice-oriented: "The study program has a professional focus, is based on well-known economic research results, taking into account the general laws and tendencies of economic systems development, motivation and behavior of market entities, social-economic processes, within which further professional career is possible." One course covers academic English to enable students to be part of the global scientific community. As mentioned above, the programme focuses on the regional and national labour market. Graduates are to find jobs at enterprises, investment and pension funds, banking and insurance companies as well as fiscal institutions.

2.2.1 Intended Learning Outcomes (as outlined in the study programmes' description)

- "Knowledge and understanding:

ILO1. To know and use economic terminology, explain basic concepts of micro- and macroeconomics.

ILO2. To understand the principles of economic science, especially the operation of economic systems.

ILO3. To be aware of the basic features of the modern world and national economy, institutional structure, directions of social, economic and foreign economic policy of the state.

- Skills:

ILO4. To be able to analyze the processes of state and market regulation of social-economic and labor relations.

ILO5. To apply analytical and methodological tools to substantiate offers and make managerial decisions by various economic agents (individuals, households, enterprises and public authorities).

ILO6. To use professional argumentation to convey information, ideas, problems, and solutions to professionals and non-professionals in the field of economic activity.

ILO7. To apply appropriate economic and mathematical methods and models to solve economic problems.

ILO8. To explain models of social-economic phenomena from the point of view of fundamental principles and knowledge based on understanding the basic directions of development of economic science.

ILO9. To analyze the functioning and development of economic entities, determine the functional areas; calculate appropriate indicators that characterize the effectiveness of their activities.

ILO10. To apply theoretical knowledge to solve practical problems and interpret the results

properly.

ILO11. To identify sources and understand the methods to determine and obtain social-economic data, collect and analyze relevant information, calculate economic and social indicators.

ILO12. To be able to use data, provide reasoning, critically evaluate logic and draw conclusions from scientific and analytical texts in economics.

ILO13. To perform an interdisciplinary analysis of social-economic phenomena and problems in one or more professional fields, taking into account the risks and potential social-economic consequences.

ILO14. To use regulatory and legal acts regulating professional activity.

ILO15. To use information and communication technologies to solve social-economic problems, prepare and submit analytical reports.

ILO16. To be able to think abstractly, apply analysis and synthesis to identify key characteristics of economic systems of various levels, as well as the behavior of their entities.

ILO17. To be able to be flexible and adapt to new situations when working with new objects under uncertain conditions.

ILO18. To analyze business, economic, financial and business activity of an enterprise, institution or organization.

ILO19. To be able to independently identify problems of economic nature when analyzing specific situations and offer ways to solve them.

ILO20. To form and evaluate the performance indicators of enterprises and institutions, taking into account the factors of the external and internal environment.

ILO21. To be able to develop optimal plans for the enterprise as a whole and its individual divisions.

ILO22. To establish economic links between elements of the enterprise management system, apply technologies of an integrated management of material, information and financial flows of the enterprise.

ILO23. To assess the potential risks, social-economic consequences of managerial decisions.

ILO24. To have knowledge of ensuring safe working conditions and the environment when conducting research in production activity.

ILO25. To choose and use the necessary scientific, methodological and analytical tools to manage economic activity.

ILO26. To be able to assess the level of economic security of the business, to examine the dynamics of the market situation and to generalize the development of situations in order to ensure the competitiveness of the enterprise

ILO27. The ability to apply knowledge and understanding to solve problems that are specific to the economy.

ILO28. The ability to provide assistance and advice to workers and the public on practical issues of life safety and emergency protection.

- Communication:

ILO29. To be a part of public society, scientific community, to accept the rule of law especially in the professional activity, to understand and be able to exercise one's own rights and freedoms, show respect to rights and freedoms of other people.

ILO30. To reproduce moral, cultural, scientific values, multiply the achievements of society in the social-economic sphere, promote a healthy lifestyle.

ILO31. To master the skills of oral and written communication in the state and foreign language.

ILO32. To demonstrate basic creative and critical thinking skills in research and professional communication.

ILO33. The ability to organize and hold conferences, round-table discussions, seminars in the native and foreign languages.

ILO34. To be able to use communication technologies to maintain harmonious business and personal contacts as a prerequisite for business success.

ILO35. To discuss, explain, reproduce one's research results, decisions.

ILO36. The ability to present and discuss results and transfer knowledge.

- Autonomy/responsibility:

ILO37. To identify and plan opportunities for personal professional development.

ILO38. To demonstrate independent work skills, critical, creative, self-critical thinking.

ILO39. To demonstrate the ability to act socially responsible and consciously relying on ethical principles, to appreciate and respect cultural and individual diversity of people.

ILO40. To demonstrate high social responsibility and comply with the principles of academic integrity.

ILO41. The ability to be responsible for the work performed and to achieve the stated goal in accordance with the requirements of professional ethics.

ILO42. The ability to adapt to new conditions, make independent decisions and initiate original research and innovative projects."

2.2.2 Curriculum

The curriculum of the study programme is designed as follows:

No.	The study program components (academic disciplines, course projects (papers), practices, qualification work	ECTS-credits	Form of examination
1	2	3	4
Compulsory components (CC)			
General training cycle			
CC 1.	Foreign Language for Specific Purposes	12	pass-fail test
CC 2.	History of Ukraine	4	exam
CC 3.	History of Ukrainian Culture	3	pass-fail test
CC 4.	Philosophy	4	exam
CC 5.	Business Ukrainian Language and Basics of Business Communication	3	pass-fail test
CC 6.	Higher Mathematics	13	exam pass-fail test
CC 7.	Probability Theory And Mathematical Statistics	7	exam
CC 8.	Computer Science	6	exam
CC 9.	Political Economy	6	exam
CC 10.	History of Economics and Economic Thought	5	exam
CC 11.	Microeconomics	8	exam
	<i>Course paper</i>		defense
CC 12.	Macroeconomics	7	exam
CC 13.	Econometrics	5	exam
CC 14.	International Economic Relations	4	pass-fail test
CC 15.	Statistics	4	exam
CC 16.	Regional Economics	4	exam
CC 17.	State Regulation of Economy	4	exam
CC 18.	Economic and mathematical methods and models	6	exam
Professional training cycle			
CC 19.	Fundamentals of Systems Theory	5	exam
CC 20.	Business Economics	10	exam pass-fail test
	<i>Course paper</i>		defense
CC 21.	Accounting	4	exam
CC 22.	Business Finance	4	pass-fail test
CC 23.	Internal Economic Mechanism of the Enterprise	6	pass-fail test
CC 24.	Marketing	5	exam
CC 25.	Economic Evaluation of Enterprise Activity	6	pass-fail test
CC 26.	Enterprise Potential and Development	6	exam
CC 27.	Enterprise Strategy	6	exam
CC 28.	Development of Business Model of an Enterprise	6	pass-fail test
	<i>Course paper</i>		defense
Total of compulsory components:		163	

Optional Components (OC)			
<i>Optional disciplines unit (General training cycle)</i>			
OC 1.1.	Legal Regulation of Economy	4	exam
OC 1.2.	Fundamentals of Law		
OC 1.3.	Finance, Money and Credit	4	exam
OC 1.4.	Financial Activity		
OC 1.5.	Economics and Organization of Labor	3	pass-fail test
OC 1.6.	Labor Economics and Social-Labor Relations		
<i>Optional disciplines unit (Professional training cycle)</i>			
OC 2.1.	Cost Management	6	exam
OC 2.2.	Income Management		
OC 2.3.	Investment Activity of an Enterprise	4	pass-fail test
OC 2.4.	Investment		
OC 2.5.	Ecological Economics	4	exam
OC 2.6.	Ecology		
OC 2.7.	Financial Analysis of Enterprise Activity	3	pass-fail test
OC 2.8.	Enterprise Taxation		
OC 2.9.	Organization of Production	7	exam
OC 2.10.	Economics and Organization of Innovative Activity		
	<i>Course paper</i>		defense
OC 2.11.	Pricing	4	exam
OC 2.12.	Controlling		
OC 2.13.	Planning and Control at the Enterprise	5	exam
OC 2.14.	Economic Cybernetics		
OC 2.15.	Foreign Economic Activity of the Enterprise	3	pass-fail test
OC 2.16.	Competitiveness Management		
OC 2.17.	Logistics	5	exam
OC 2.18.	Mathematical Modeling of Business Activity		
OC 2.19.	Start-up training course	3	pass-fail test
OC 2.20.	Entrepreneurship and Business Culture		
OC 2.21.	Substantiation of Business Decisions and Risk Assessment	6	exam
OC 2.22.	Economic Substantiation of Projects		
OC 2.23.	Economic Security of the Enterprise	4	pass-fail test
OC 2.24.	Risk Studies		
Total of optional components:		65	
Practical training		12	
OVERALL TOTAL		240	

Credit points are distributed throughout the programme in the following way:

- Compulsory courses

- General courses (obligatory for all students enrolled at the Bachelor's level): 105 credit points
- Professional courses (obligatory for all students of the Bachelor's programme in Economics): 58 credit points
- Optional courses
 - General courses (electives for all students enrolled at the Bachelor's level): 11 credit points)
 - Professional courses (electives for all students of the Bachelor's programme in Economics): 54 credit points
- Internship: 12 credit points.

2.2.3 Methods of Teaching and Student Assessment

Through the combined use of lectures and practical classes applying case methods, business games and interdisciplinary trainings, students are to develop interpersonal and leadership and teamwork skills. It was mentioned that a certain share of courses was partly or even entirely taught in English. Throughout the programme, students are continuously supported and advised by their respective teachers.

As indicated above, the students' learning progress is continuously assessed in class. The applied assessment forms are oral and written exams, pass-fail tests and presentations.

In line with the general vision of CPNU, a special emphasis lies on sustainability. In the digital talks, the members of faculty emphasized that competencies were conveyed through project work. Moreover, students are trained to give public speeches with a view to the requirements of the labour market.

2.2.4 Experts' Appraisal

The panel would like to commend CPNU on the implementation of its economics degree. In a short time, the university has managed to set up a programme, which is in high demand by both potential students and employers alike. The experts find that the programme is in line with the desired qualification level as defined by the Qualifications Framework for the EHEA.

With regards to the teaching content, the study programme would benefit from a more distinct profile. As indicated above, the programme currently counts 42 intended learning outcomes, a number, which may potentially lead to a rather indistinct profile of programme graduates. The panel recommends distinguishing the economics degree more clearly from a management degree.

As a general recommendation, the panel thus suggests gearing the curriculum more strongly towards international standards, both in terms of content and with regards to the reference literature. With regards to the curricular content, it is suggested to either focus on political economy or business-oriented topics like human resources, organisation and leadership. These two different areas of specialisation might be offered through electives.

Moreover, core competencies like scientific research should be strengthened even further, for

example through the introduction of a final thesis. The experts also recommend introducing supplementary topics to the obligatory part of the programme, such as ecological/responsible management, business ethics and cost management. On the other hand, the course on “start-up training” might become an elective.

The panel commends CPNU on its initiative to introduce a course on international economics entirely taught in English into the curriculum, commencing in the next academic year. The panel highly encourages CPNU to further pursue this path of internationalisation.

2.3 Tourism (Master of Arts)

The Master’s programme “Tourism” was introduced in 2016 at CPNU. It was updated in 2019 according to national legislative standards.

The programme is described as practice-oriented: “The purpose of training is acquisition of general and professional competences for successful implementation of economic, organizational, management, project, production and technological activities in the field of recreation, tourism and resorts.” One course covers academic English to enable students to be part of the global scientific community. As mentioned above, the programme focuses on the regional and national labour market. Graduates are thus prepared for the organization and management of tourism as well as for research, analysis and prediction of developments in the tourism sector.

Especially sustainable and green tourism was described as being of special interest for local businesses.

Special emphasis is put on networking with potential employers who are often CPNU graduates. During the digital talks, several stakeholders of the university mentioned that business owners were invited to conduct workshops on starting new businesses. In addition to that, regular excursions are conducted regionally and nationally.

2.3.1 Intended Learning Outcomes

According to the documentation, graduates shall have obtained:

- “1) The knowledge of advanced concepts, methods of scientific research and professional activity on the border of tourism and recreation.
- 2) The ability to understand and apply theory and methodology of tourism studies into practice.
- 3) The ability to use information and innovative methods and technology in the field of tourism.
- 4) The knowledge of patterns, principles and mechanisms of tourism market functioning.
- 5) The ability to evaluate the tourism market conditions, interpret the results of the study and predict the directions of development of the business entity in the recreation and tourism field.
- 6) The ability to manage the enterprise of the tourism and recreation industry.
- 7) The ability to develop and implement projects in the field of recreation, tourism, hospitality.

- 8) To be fluent in the official language and use it for the professional activity.
- 9) To practice the use of foreign language(s) in the professional activity.
- 10) To act in a multicultural environment.
- 11) To use communication skills and technologies, initiate the introduction of communication management methods into practice of tourism business entities.
- 12) To demonstrate social responsibility for the results of strategic decisions made.
- 13) To make decisions under complex and unpredictable conditions that require the use of new approaches and forecasting methods.
- 14) To be responsible for the development of professional knowledge and practices, assessment of the strategic development of the team, formation of an effective personnel policy.
- 15) To demonstrate the ability of self-development and self-improvement on a lifelong basis.
- 16) To initiate innovative complex projects, to show leadership during their realization.”

2.3.2 Concept and Structure

Academic discipline code	The study program components (academic disciplines, course projects (papers), practices, qualification work	ECTS-credits	Form of examination
1	2	3	4
Compulsory Components			
5.1.1.1	Foreign Language for Scientific Communication	6	Pass-fail test
5.1.1.2	Methodology and Organization of Research and Intellectual Property	3	Pass-fail test
5.2.1.1	Tourism Studies	4	Exam
5.2.1.2	International Tourism	4	Exam
5.2.1.3	Rural Tourism	9	Exam
5.2.1.4	Planning and Forecasting of Tourism Activity	5	Exam
5.2.1.5	Innovative Technologies in Tourism	3	Pass-fail test
5.2.1.6	Quality and Tourism Project Management	3	Pass-fail test
	Pre-diploma practice	15	Pass-fail test
	Total of compulsory disciplines	52	
Optional Components			
	Of general training		
5.1.2.1	Civil Protection and Labor Protection in the Field	3	Pass-fail test
	Environmental Protection Activity		
5.2.2.1	Personnel Management	4	Exam
	Labor Economics		
5.2.2.2	Specialized Tourism Organization	5	Exam
	Wine Tourism		
5.2.2.3	Excursion Studies	4	Exam
	Organization of Exhibition and Fair Activities		
5.2.2.4	Management of Regional Tourism Development	4	Exam
	Management of Tourism Territories		
5.2.2.5	Tourism Enterprise Management	3	Pass-fail test
	Management of Sports and Animation Centers		
	Total of optional disciplines	23	
	Preparation of a qualification work	15	Defense
	Overall total	90	

Credit points are distributed throughout the programme in the following way:

- Compulsory Disciplines – 52 credit points,
- Optional Disciplines – 23 credit points;
- Preparation of final thesis – 15 credit points.

2.3.3 Methods of Teaching and Student Assessment

Through the combined use of lectures, multimedia lectures, practical classes, seminars, individual classes, laboratory work, consultations, self-study, e-learning and the preparation of the final thesis, students are to gain independent problem-solving and analytical skills. It was mentioned that a certain share of courses is partly taught in English. Moreover, their social and leadership skills shall be enhanced. Throughout the programme, they are continuously supported and advised by their respective teachers.

As indicated above, the students' learning progress is continuously assessed in class. The applied assessment forms are oral and written exams, examination reviews, pass-fail tests, defence of internship reports and course papers and the final thesis.

Special emphasize lies on excursions and project work. Excursions are organized and conducted by the students themselves. The choice of destination, organizational preparation and practical realization of the excursion lies in the students' hands which sharpens competencies required on the labour market and hence contributes to the students' employability.

2.3.4 Experts' Appraisal

The panel would like to commend CPNU on the implementation of its tourism degree. In a short time, the university has managed to set up a programme, which is in high demand by both potential students and employers alike.

With regards to the teaching content, the study programme has so far focused on local, regional and national developments. The panel recommends including globalization and modern information technologies in the curriculum. Moreover, topics like sustainable development and climate change should be further emphasized as current challenges in the study programme.

The panel understands that the current circumstances, imposed by the pandemic, pose new challenges and restrictions to the tourism as an academic discipline in Ukraine. That is why the panel commends CPNU on its devotion and flexibility in further developing the study programme with a view to align it with international academic standards as well as taking into account the students' feedback. The upcoming introduction of additional courses, taught entirely in English, as a result of students' request, proves the dynamic and careful development the programme is taking. The panel highly encourages CPNU to further pursue this path.

With regards to the allocation of credit points, the expert panel recommends awarding credit-points for the delivery of the Master's thesis and its oral defence.

2.4 **Management (Doctor of Philosophy)**

The doctoral programme "Management" was introduced in 2016 at CPNU. Accordingly, the first graduate of the programme finished in 2020.

The programme is described as both research and practice-oriented: "*Scientific* researches on development of effective mechanisms and models of management, strategies and policies of

management of economic systems at all levels have wide *practical* application, since they take into account the current tendencies of management development, regional specificity in the conditions of deepening of integration processes of Ukraine.” Courses are partly taught in English to enable students to be part of the global scientific community. As mentioned above, the programme focuses on the regional and national labour market. Graduates are thus prepared for scientific, administrative or managerial positions in educational institutions or regional economic businesses. The development of industrial parks was described as one current area of interest of local businesses.

2.4.1 Intended Learning Outcomes

According to the documentation, graduates shall be able to:

- “1. Form a systematic scientific outlook, to possess modern theories and concepts in the sphere of management (PLO1)
2. Organize and conduct original scientific research in the field of management at the appropriate professional level, achieve scientific results that create new knowledge to solve current problems of theory and practice (PLO2)
3. Demonstrate the skills of independent research, flexible thinking, openness to new knowledge, evaluate the results of autonomous work and be responsible for personal professional development and training of others (PLO3)
4. Initiate, develop and implement projects in the field of management, manage them and search for partners for their implementation (PLO4)
5. Apply scientific and pedagogical technologies, formulate content, goals of training, ways of their achievement, forms of control, be responsible for the effectiveness of the educational process (PLO5)
6. Demonstrate the skills of scientific communication, international cooperation, to represent the broad scientific community and the public in the field of management using state and foreign languages in oral and written form (PLO6)
7. Carry out critical analysis, summarize research findings, formulate and substantiate conclusions and proposals for the development of conceptual and methodological knowledge in management (PLO7)
8. Demonstrate the skills of presenting and publicizing the results of scientific research in the state and foreign languages, both orally and in writing (PLO8)
9. Choose and use general scientific and special methods of scientific researches in the field of management (PLO9)
10. Approve and implement the results of own research in the field of management (PLO10)
11. Act on ethical considerations and academic integrity in the conduct of research, the

dissemination of results and their implementation (PLO11)

12. Understand the theoretical foundations and prerequisites of competition in the implementation of economic activities of regional entities; basic principles and elements of the concept of regional competitiveness and activation of regional development of the state (PLO12)
13. To determine the vector of goals of long-term socioeconomic development of the region; assess the main indicators of competitiveness of regional economic systems and develop a strategy for their development (PLO13)
14. Conduct research in the field of innovation and investment management, compile analytical materials on innovation and investment issues, develop proposals to improve regional innovation and investment policy, conduct an examination of investment programs and projects (PLO14).”

2.4.2 Concept and Structure

Code	Components of the educational program (training disciplines, course projects (work), practical training, qualification work)	ECTS credits	Form of final assessment
1	2	3	4
Compulsory components			
General training unit			
CC 1	English for scientific communication	12	Pass-fail test, exam
CC 2	Philosophy	6	Pass-fail test, exam
CC 3	Methodology, organization and technology of research	9	Pass-fail test, exam
Professional training unit			
CC 4	Actual problems of economic theory	3	Pass-fail test
CC 5	Modern problems of development of Ukraine economy	3	Pass-fail test
CC 6	Modelling and forecasting of development of socio-economic systems	3	Pass-fail test
CC 7	Economic diagnostics	3	Pass-fail test
CC 8	Problems of economy and management of modern organizational structures	3	Pass-fail test
CC 9	Educational and pedagogical practice	3	Pass-fail test
	Total amount of the compulsory subjects	45	
Elective components of the general training			
EC 1.1	Regional-administrative management	3	exam
EC 1.2	Institutional support of regional-administrative management		
EC 2.1	Competitiveness strategies of regional economic systems	3	exam
EC 2.2	Strategic management of regional development		
EC 3.1	Strategies for sustainable development of regional economic systems	3	Pass-fail test
EC 3.2	Innovation and investment management of regional development		
EC 4.1	Infrastructural support for regional development	3	Pass-fail test
EC 4.2	Information technologies in regional management		
EC 5.1	Human resources management in the region	3	Pass-fail test
EC 5.2	Program methods for human resources development in the region		
	Total amount of the elective subjects	15	
	Overall scope of the study program	60	

Credit points are distributed throughout the programme in the following way:

- Subjects of General Training – 27 credit points;
- Subjects of Professional Training:
 - Compulsory Disciplines – 15 credit points,
 - Elective Disciplines – 15 credit points;
- Educational and Pedagogical Practice – 3 credit points.

2.4.3 Methods of Teaching and Student Assessment

The self-report states that the programme is based on the concept of student-centred learning. Through the combined use of lectures, practical classes and seminars, case studies, business games, interdisciplinary trainings, the internship and the final thesis, students are to gain independent research and problem-solving skills. Moreover, their social and leadership skills need to be enhanced. Throughout the programme, they are continuously supported and advised by the respective teachers.

Moreover, Ph.D. students actively participate in application for grants and – provided they are successful – in the allocation of research budgets, the fulfilment of project contracts and the preparation of reporting documents.

As indicated above, the students' learning progress is continuously assessed in class. Special emphasis lies on their research papers, publications and the Ph.D. thesis.

2.4.4 Experts' Appraisal

In general, the panel concludes that the programme successfully prepares graduates for the local labour market, both in the realm of academia and business. The combined use of theoretical input and practical application through lectures, seminars, independent research work and compulsory internships provides students with the necessary skills and networking opportunities to foster their careers. The tightly knit support web for students further contributes to the quality of student learning.

With regards to the allocation of credit points, the expert panel recommends awarding credit-points for the delivery of the PhD-thesis and its oral defence.

The panel congratulates CPNU on the inclusion of international elements in the curriculum and on inviting external guest lecturers from abroad. The panel encourages the university to further strengthen these developments. The panel recommends seizing the current digitalization of teaching and learning in order to further facilitate the integration of international academic discourses into the programme.

2.5 **Economics (Doctor of Philosophy)**

The doctoral programme "Economics" was introduced at CPNU in 2016. It was updated in 2019 in reaction to feedback from the universities' stakeholders. The first graduate completed the programme in the academic year 2019/2020.

The programme is described as research-oriented: "The object of study is identification and substantiation of the current issues of social-economic systems management at macro-, meso- and micro-level; development and practical implementation of original scientific research, the results of which are of scientific novelty, theoretical and practical importance, preparation and defense of dissertations." One course with a focus on academic English serves to enable students to be part of the global scientific community. As mentioned above, the programme focuses on the regional and national labour market. Graduates are to find jobs as "legislators, senior civil servants, managers, teachers of higher education institutions. They can hold positions in departments and laboratories of scientific institutions, specialized departments of universities, as well as relevant jobs in enterprises, institutions and organizations."

2.5.1 Intended Learning Outcomes

- "Knowledge and understanding:

ILO 1. Knowledge and understanding of research methods, abilities and skills to use PhD research methods.

ILO 2. Knowledge and understanding of the foreign language, skills in presenting scientific results in oral and written forms, understanding of scientific and professional texts, skills to communicate in a foreign scientific and professional environment; be able to work in an international context.

ILO 3. Knowledge and understanding of the theory and methodology of systematic analysis, application of systematic approach in the study of economic processes, development of social-economic systems; the ability to use the methodology of systematic analysis in the field of economics; the ability and skills to use the principles of systematic analysis in the management of economic systems.

ILO 4. Knowledge and understanding of modern management theories and evolution of specific management functions under the influence of scientific and technological progress; objective pattern, goals, social-economic conditions of management of modern organizational structures.

ILO 5. Knowledge and understanding of methodological bases of functioning of the regulation mechanism of national economy; methods, forms and means for implementing the regulation of the national economy; features of state regulation of social-economic systems of different levels of hierarchy.

ILO 6. Knowledge and understanding of the basic theories of growth and development, evolution of scientific knowledge in the field of change management; conducting a critical analysis of changes in a business entity; the ability to generate, select and justify ways to develop a business entity.

ILO 7. Knowledge and understanding of models of social-economic development, identification of tendencies and key priority areas of economic development, formulation of economic policy's direction.

ILO 8. Knowledge and understanding of general concepts and stages of mathematical modeling of social-economic systems and processes; basics of optimal (mathematical) programming; essence of methods of mathematical-statistical analysis and forecasting of economic dynamics; problem solving on the basis of formulated models both by analytical methods and using computers; mathematical apparatus for the study of a wide range of typical and applied problems of economic analysis and decision-making.

ILO 9. Knowledge, understanding, abilities and skills in using citation rules and references to sources used, rules of bibliographic design, understanding of the content and procedure for calculating basic quantitative scientometric indicators of scientific activity efficiency (citation index, h-index, impact factor).

ILO 10. Knowledge and understanding of the structure of higher education in Ukraine, specifics of professional and pedagogical activity of the teacher at a higher education institution.

- Skills:

ILO 11. Skills in using statistical methods of analysis to identify the development trends of research objects.

ILO 12. Skills in following the latest developments in the professional field and finding scientific sources relevant to the field of scientific interests of a PhD student, working with different sources, searching, processing, analyzing and synthesizing the information obtained.

ILO 13. Skills in working with modern bibliographic and referential data bases as well as with databases platforms (Scopus, Web of Science, Web of Knowledge, Astrophysics, PubMed, Mathematics, Springer, Agris, GeoRef).

ILO 14. Skills in understanding scientific articles in the field of the chosen specialty, analyzing information sources, identifying contradictions and tasks (problems) or parts of them that have not been solved previously, formulating scientific hypotheses.

ILO 15. Skills in organizing creative activities and the process of scientific research, using modern technologies of scientific work, evaluating and ensuring the quality of work performed.

ILO 16. Skills in perceiving and analyzing other people's thoughts and ideas critically, finding one's own ways to solve problems, analyzing one's own materials critically, generating new ideas, making informed decisions.

ILO 17. Skills in developing and implementing projects and programs of processes and systems, as well as their structure-forming elements in the field of economic sciences.

ILO 18. Knowledge and skills in using legislative and regulatory support of higher education, modern means and technologies of organization and implementation of educational process, various aspects of educational work with students, innovative teaching methods.

ILO 19. Skills in organizing creative activity, writing articles and reports, performing independent original and publishable research in the field of social and behavioral sciences of economic direction, exploring and comprehending various relationships and interactions thoroughly (technological, organizational, legal, etc.) within economic sciences, conducting research to improve their efficiency, organizing self-examination on the compliance of the dissertation materials with the established requirements.

ILO 20. Skills in analyzing specific educational, scientific and professional texts in the field of the chosen specialty, identifying theoretical and practical problems as well as controversial issues in educational, scientific and professional texts in the field of economic sciences; skills in identifying, setting and solving scientific tasks and problems.

ILO 21. Skills in identifying complicated problems in the field of economic science and business practice; applying the acquired theoretical knowledge to solve specific business problems at micro, meso and macro levels; pointing out strategic priorities of the national economy development, taking into account best world practices of civilizational transformations.

ILO 22. Skills in applying methods for economic diagnosis of social-economic development of national and regional economic systems;

ILO 23. Skills in evaluating resistance level of social-economic systems to external and internal

threats; choosing appropriate methods for monitoring the development of social-economic systems of different levels.

- Communication:

ILO 24. Skills in communicating with a wide scientific community and public in the field of scientific and/or professional activity with the purpose of (1) discussing controversial issues, research results and coordinating actions and joint work at conferences, scientific seminars; (2) bringing research results and innovations to colleagues; (3) presenting, defending the research results, discussing them with the scientific and professional community; (4) using modern means of visual presentation of research results.

ILO 25. To be a part of public society, scientific community, to accept the rule of law especially in the professional activity, to understand and be able to exercise one's own rights and freedoms, show respect to rights and freedoms of other people.

ILO 26. Skills in arranging and conducting conferences, round-table discussions, and seminars using the native or foreign languages.

ILO 27. To be able to use communication technologies to maintain harmonious business and personal contacts as a prerequisite for business success.”

2.5.2 Concept and Structure

No.	The study program components (academic disciplines, course projects (papers), practices, qualification work	ECTS-credits	Form of examination
1	2	3	4
Compulsory Components (CC)			
General training cycle			
CC 1.	Philosophy	6	pass-fail test exam
CC 2.	English for Scientific Communication	12	pass-fail test exam
CC 3.	Methodology, Organization and Technology of Scientific Research	9	pass-fail test exam
Professional training cycle			
CC 4.	Current Problems of Economic Theory	3	pass-fail test
CC 5.	Modern Problems of Development of Ukrainian Economy	3	pass-fail test
CC 6.	Modelling and Forecasting of Social-Economic Systems Development	3	pass-fail test
CC 7.	Economic Diagnostics	3	pass-fail test
CC 8.	Problems of Economy and Management of Modern Organizational Structures	3	pass-fail test
Total of compulsory components:		42	
Optional Components (OC)			
Professional training cycle			
OC 1.1.	Methods and Models of Regulation of National Economy Development	5	pass-fail test
OC 1.2.	Modern Models of State Regulation of Social-Economic Systems		
OC 1.3.	Changes and Development Management of Business Entities	5	pass-fail test
OC 1.4.	Functioning of Economic Systems at the Micro Level		
OC 1.5.	Economic Security of the National Economy	5	pass-fail test
OC 1.6.	Monitoring of social-Economic Development of the State		
Total of optional components:		15	
CC 9. Practical training		3	
OVERALL TOTAL		60	

Credit points are distributed throughout the programme in the following way:

- Compulsory courses: 42 credit points
- Optional courses: 15 credit points

- Internship: 3 credit points.

2.5.3 Methods of Teaching and Student Assessment

The self-report states that the programme is based on student-centred learning and focuses on research innovation. Through the combination of lectures, seminars, consultations and independent research students are to gain analytical and problem-solving skills. Throughout the programme, they are continuously supported and advised by the respective academic supervisors.

Moreover, Ph.D. students actively participate in application for grants and – provided they are successful – in the allocation of research budgets, the fulfilment of project contracts and the preparation of reporting documents.

As indicated above, the students' learning progress is continuously assessed in class. Special emphasis lies on their research papers, publications and presentations at conferences. Annually, Ph.D. students have to report to the Scientific Council of CPNU on their individual research progress.

In addition to the defence of the Ph.D. thesis a final assessment, takes place in the form of an written exam.

2.5.4 Experts' Appraisal

In general, the panel concludes that the programme successfully prepares graduates for the local labour market, both in the realm of academia and business. The combined use of theoretical input and practical application through lectures, seminars, independent research work and the compulsory internship provides students with the necessary skills and networking opportunities to foster their careers. The tightly knit support web for students further increases the quality of student learning. The inclusion of students in current research projects of the teaching faculty surely contributes to enhancing their expertise.

With regards to the allocation of credit points, the expert panel recommends awarding credit-points for the delivery of the PhD-thesis and its oral defence.

The panel congratulates CPNU on the inclusion of international elements in the curriculum and on inviting external guest lecturers from abroad. The university is encouraged to continue down this path of internationalisation.

It was reported that a course on methodology and technology is delivered entirely in English, which corresponds to the students' general wish for more classes taught in English. The panel recommends seizing the current digitalization of teaching and learning in order to enhance the integration of international academic discourses even further.

Also, the experts recommend including Game Theory as a topic in the curriculum.

3. Teaching Faculty

The university has submitted CVs of the teaching faculty of all study programmes that are subject of this review procedure. The total amount of teaching hours is divided as follows among the members of faculty:

teaching hours covered	Management PhD	Economics PhD	Economics Bachelor	Tourism Master
% without a scientific degree	-	-	4,6%	-
% Doctors	47%	47%	23,3%	30%
% PhDs	53%	53%	72,1 %	70%
% full-time staff	100%	100%	100%	100%

During the digital site visit the expert panel also had a chance to speak to the heads of the respective academic departments and to other members of faculty to complete the picture provided in the self-report.

The criteria and the procedure for the selection of teaching staff are outlined in the self-report and are based on published regulations. In order to evaluate the teaching competency of the applicant, test lectures or practical classes are conducted. Research activity and teaching experience also play an important role. The working contracts of all lecturers have to be renewed at least every five years.

The members of faculty are supported in their professional development: for instance, they may participate in in-house trainings seminars concerning topics of relevance for their daily work, as e.g. teaching methods or national and international grant application. Lecturers are also encouraged to absolve internships at enterprises or other organisations as a form of advanced training. Faculty members may also participate in the Erasmus+ programme. In the past, teachers have, for example, visited Latvia, Germany and Slovenia. Incoming teachers from Norway and other countries were welcomed as guest lecturers.

Research endeavours of teaching staff are financially supported by the university. With regards to the share of workload, members of the teaching body reported that they had to deliver 1500 hours during an academic year, out of which 400-600 hours are foreseen for teaching activities. In case staff members deliver a good research performance (as demonstrated, for example, through their citation index in scopus or web of sciences), their teaching load may be reduced. On average, a professor employed on a full-time basis is expected to teach four or five courses per academic year. In case she or he is actively engaged in research, only two to three courses are required.

As mentioned above, students are actively involved in research projects. For example, a research project on sustainable development is being conducted with the active participation of students at the department of theoretical and applied economics.

3.1.1 Experts' Appraisal

During the virtual meetings, faculty and staff displayed a high level of commitment to their work and their students. The relatively small size of the teaching body fosters a strong team spirit among colleagues, especially within each department.

The academic qualifications of the teachers are generally quite high, the majority holding a "Candidate of Science" or a higher degree, which is equivalent to level 8 of the European Qualification Framework (doctoral degree). Teachers without such academic merits are mostly (but not exclusively) responsible for classes outside the core disciplines.

However, the experts noticed that at least in some cases the variety of topics covered by one single teacher seems unusually large.

Even though the experts appreciate the lecturers' intention to develop their expertise beyond their own specialisation, they also see the risk of a long-term negative impact on the quality of the study programmes. Hence, the university should take particular care to prevent the range of subjects taught by each lecturer from becoming too diverse.

Furthermore, a large part of the teaching staff is recruited internally, i.e. among CPNU graduates. Although the experts are aware that this procedure is in no way unusual, they recommend extending the scope of job advertisements to national or even international recruiting media and academic platforms. This might make it easier to attract applicants with a strong international profile, which would also be more in line with the overall institutional strategy.

With regards to staff development, the experts recommend further extending the measures already being taken. The university should ensure that all members of the teaching faculty – including associate and assistant lecturers – are provided with professional development opportunities, which should encompass input on teaching didactics.

The active involvement of teaching staff and students into research activities is laudable.

4. Infrastructure, Resources and Student Support

Due to the travel restrictions imposed by the pandemic, the panel conducted the site visit online. Hence, the assessment is based on the oral and written descriptions and the visual information about the campus provided in form of pictures and videos.

All teaching and learning activities at CPNU happen on the central campus which includes lecture rooms, multimedia labs and laboratories, a conference hall as well as the library and all student service units. Most of the (small or medium-sized) lecture rooms are equipped with computers, projectors and furniture. Accommodation for students is also provided in several buildings. Free Wifi is available in almost all classrooms and the library.

There are various support services at the students' disposal, which are provided by different organisational units on campus, for example:

- Student trade union committee – protection of students' rights;
- Academic affairs office – consultation and paper work on studying issues;
- International relations office – consultation on international programmes and projects, translation of transcript of records and other certificates, organisation of presentations of international programmes and projects for students etc.;
- Office on the issues of employment, practices and public relations – organisation of internships in Ukraine and abroad, career counselling, employment support, organization of job fair etc.
- Editorial and publishing office – printing services.

If necessary, intense English courses are offered if potential students do not meet the necessary level of English proficiency when applying for a Bachelor's or Master's programme.

According to Ukrainian legislation, participants in the military conflict in Eastern Ukraine can study for free or with tuition reduction at state universities. CPNU also offers scholarships for students coming from socially disadvantaged backgrounds.

In March 2020, CPNU shifted its entire course offerings to an online format due to the pandemic. Both teachers and students reported that this – understandably and as in almost all Higher Education Institutions – initiated an immense internal learning process involving all stakeholders of the university. Even before the pandemic, the learning platform Moodle was used to facilitate the organisation of the learning process. Lectures are delivered via Zoom.

The software applications used in the study programmes are reportedly MS Word, GIS and C1. There are computers available for the students' use on campus. Since the shift to online learning, students have been using their private hardware.

The scientific library provides books and e-sources. The library's stock was described as sufficient and adequate by the university members. CPNU also provides access to national open access online resources such as the "National Library of Ukraine", to "Scientific Periodicals of Ukraine" and the "Open Ukrainian Citation Index". The international databases "SCOPUS",

“Web of Science” and “ScienceDirect” are available through paid access. Currently, test subscriptions for “WILEY” and “Springer Nature” are running. Other open access resources such as Google Scholar, DOAJ and EBSCO are frequently accessed.

The library also organizes cultural events and monitors academic works of the students for plagiarism.

Additionally, a psychological support service is offered, which was described as being in especially high demand since the start of the pandemic.

4.1.1 Experts' Appraisal

The experts' general impression is that CPNU students benefit from an adequate learning environment which provides stable conditions for successful teaching and learning. Although some measures for further enhancement are recommended, the overall picture is positive.

As far as the central library is concerned, the experts have identified potential for improvement: according to students, textbooks and scientific articles are mostly downloaded from the internet, and even before the Corona pandemic only few used the library as a place for self-studying on a regular basis. As a first step for improvement, the experts recommend providing each department with an annual budget for the subscription to international databases and journals as well as the acquisition of new textbooks and teaching materials. The university should also establish criteria for selecting and purchasing new publications and develop general guidelines for this endeavour. For all academic members of the university, the experts highly recommend making full licences of citation software like “Citavi”, “Endnote” or “Zotero” available. In addition, a regular screening for up-to-date and purpose-built software in the respective fields of study can contribute to a state-of-the-art education (i.e. simulation games, analytical tools, industry applications).

The expert panel regards the student support structures provided at CPNU as fit-for-purpose. Students described the teaching faculty and the institutionalized support services as open and responsive to their needs.

5. Quality Assurance

CPNU has set up an internal quality management system which is described in detail in the self-report. The roles and responsibilities within the system are clearly defined: for instance, an internal quality assurance unit has been founded to co-ordinate all activities and to provide support and advice to the Rectorate and the departments in all matters concerning quality assurance and quality development. The quality assurance unit currently consists of two staff members.

Several instruments and procedures for the monitoring and periodic review of study programmes have been developed. These include course evaluation by students based on a questionnaire, a sample of which was included in the supplements to the self-report. The results of these surveys have an impact on the internal performance ranking of teachers and also flow into the regular reports of the Heads of the Departments to the Rectorate and the Academic Council. One questionnaire was designed by the Department of Social Sciences.

During the online talks, the panel also learned that the student council conducts its own evaluations and is in regular contact with the administrative and managerial units of the university. Examples for the introduction of changes in response to the students' feedback were delivered such as the updating of the library stock, changes to the curricula or talks with members of the teaching body. Moreover, some departments design their own additional questionnaires.

It was emphasized that quality assurance at CPNU includes all internal and external stakeholders of the university, as e.g. teachers, (potential) students, administrative staff, employers, graduates and local governing bodies. Written surveys, consultations during visits to enterprises and the inclusion of external stakeholders in department meetings are mentioned as most important evaluation methods. As stated in the submitted documentation, the departments design and conduct their own evaluation surveys. The information received on the conduct of the surveys was mixed, either they were conducted in written form or online via a Google platform. In all cases, evaluation surveys are conducted anonymously.

Graduate surveys are conducted on a regular basis in order to trace the career development of alumni.

CPNU also monitors the graduates' satisfaction regarding their preparation for the labour market and keeps track of their professional careers for the purpose of quality assurance. In addition, the university conducts surveys among existing and prospective employers of graduates to receive feedback on their fitness for the requirements of the job market.

5.1.1 Experts' Appraisal

Based on the self-report and the outcomes of the virtual meetings, the experts have arrived at the overall conclusion that CPNU has created a sound basis for an effective system of quality assurance for its study programmes, in which all stakeholder groups, including students, employers and graduates, participate to a satisfying extent. In the future, the focus should lie on further streamlining and developing the evaluation tools.

In particular, the experts find that the evaluation questionnaires need to be revised in a number of ways:

Firstly, the questionnaire presented in the self-reported contains frequently double-barrelled questions. In order to receive more specific and precise evaluation results, the questionnaire should be re-designed, asking for one specific information with each question. Secondly, the questions should check whether students think that they have actually achieved the intended learning outcomes of the course. Currently, the questionnaires rather ask for wishes in terms of further improvement of the of the students' learning experience. Thirdly, a "free comment" section asking for suggestions for further improvements might be a good idea. Fourthly, the actual workload of students should be systematically assessed as part of every course evaluation survey. Finally, a standardized assessment scale should be introduced. Currently, students and graduates can express their level of satisfaction in terms of points, percentages and letters.

The experts strongly recommended designing one questionnaire that integrates the above-mentioned aspects and applying it consistently in all study programmes.

The experts' general impression is that the university draws conclusions from the results of surveys and, if necessary, takes measures for improvement in response.

During the virtual meetings, some of the students mentioned that the results of course evaluation were not always made known to them. The university should ensure that this principle of providing constant feedback and maintaining a continuous dialogue with students regarding quality issues is firmly put into practice by all members of faculty at all times.

Concerning the regular maintenance and updating of the literature, the panel also highly recommends an allocation of responsibilities. Currently, a member of the teaching staff gets assigned as "guarantor" for one study programme. This function might also be taken over by the head of the department. The "guarantor" is the person in charge of updating the reference literature for each course in the programme on a regular basis. Even though this approach is already quite effective, the panel would like to suggest a slightly different procedure: ideally, the person who designs or teaches the course should be in charge of updating the reference literature, too. He or she should be supported by the quality assurance department, which regularly reminds faculty members to update the reference literature.

6. Transparency and Public Information

CPNU has published extensive information on its activities, the institutional profile and its study programmes on the university website, which is mostly available in Ukrainian.

The website contains descriptions of the central contents of all study programmes. Course catalogues for most of the programmes are available for download, but seem to exist in Ukrainian only. The most important official documents (as, for example, regulations on student assessment and examination) are also published online, but seem to be available only in Ukrainian.

Diploma Supplements are issued along with the final results and are in line with the European Standards and Guidelines.

6.1.1 Experts' Assessment

By and large, the experts found that CPNU provides sufficient information regarding its study programmes to all internal and external stakeholders.

With the strategic goal of internationalisation in mind, the experts are of the opinion that information on the application and admission process needs to be published in English on the university website. Additionally, the curricula of the study programmes need to be made available in English. The same applies to central documents such as examination regulations or information on student assessment (cf. Chapter 2.1.).

IV. Appendix

1. Statement of the University in Response to the Expert Report

Statement of the University in Response to the Expert Report

Chernihiv Polytechnic National University (CPNU) would like to express gratitude to the Central Evaluation and Accreditation Agency for efficient organization and supportive communication on the international accreditation of the Cluster: Tourism – Management – Economics and to the Expert Panel for the objective and impartial evaluation of the study programs. Constructive recommendations and proposals for improving the study programs and their activities, expressed by the expert group during the online site-visit and reflected in the Accreditation Report, are taken into account and are used to improve the quality of higher education provided at the university.

Considering the ongoing process of university development, we would like to point out several changes that took place during the accreditation process and that reflect separate aspects highlighted by the Expert Panel and given as general recommendations.

Firstly, the rights and responsibilities of the student club are officially described in the *regulations on student self-governance*, in particular: Regulations on the rights and responsibilities of group leaders, Regulations on student self-government, Regulations on the procedure for holding elections to the representative and executive bodies of the student self-government bodies, Regulations on the student curator (tutor). These are present on the Ukrainian version of the university website and will be published in English once ready. Moreover, the university is developing the system of *students' e-cabinets*, where there will be a separate section prepared with short extracts of the main documents regulating the educational process at CPNU to make all students acquainted with their rights and responsibilities.

Secondly, special language training for teachers is provided by the *Program on increasing the level of English language proficiency of research and teaching staff*, developed by the Department of Foreign Languages for Specific Purposes of CNUT in 2020. The English language courses are planned for teachers on the basis of the Foreign Language Centre functioning at the university. Apart from that, teachers have access to the online resources like “Language Skills” and Coursera.

Understanding the importance of using international literature and resources in the educational process, Scientific Library of CPNU is providing access in 2021 to the following *International databases and prepaid platforms*:

1.	SCOPUS	https://www.scopus.com
2.	Web of Science	https://www.webofknowledge.com/
3.	ScienceDirect	www.sciencedirect.com



IV Appendix

1 Statement of the University in Response to the Expert Report

There is also test access provided to:

1.	WILEY	https://onlinelibrary.wiley.com/
2.	Springer Nature	https://www.springernature.com/gp

The university also submitted application to get access to the The American Society of Mechanical Engineers, ASME (<https://asmedigitalcollection.asme.org/pages/topic-collections>).

Educational and scientific workers are informed of the advantages of using the following open access resources:

1.	Google Scholar	https://scholar.google.com.ua/
2.	ResearchBib	www.researchbib.com
3.	DOAJ (Directory of Open Access Journals)	https://doaj.org/
4.	BASE: Bielefeld Academic Search Engine	https://www.base-search.net/
5.	OAlster	oaister.worldcat.org
6.	SCImago Journal & Country Rank	https://www.scimagojr.com/
7.	WorldWideScience.org	https://worldwidescience.org/
8.	EconBiz (Virtual Library for Economics and Business Studies)	https://www.econbiz.de/
9.	EULER search engine	https://www.emis.de/projects/EULER/
10.	FreeFullPDF	http://www.freefullpdf.com/#gsc.tab=0
11.	Metasearch Search Engine	https://www.search.com/
12.	Microsoft Academic Search	https://academic.microsoft.com/
13.	RefSeek	https://www.refseek.com/
14.	Science.gov	https://www.science.gov/
15.	ScienceResearch.com	https://www.scienceresearch.com/scienceresearch/desktop/en/search.html
16.	CiteSeerX	https://citeseerx.ist.psu.edu/index
17.	EBSCOhost	https://www.ebsco.com/
18.	SCImago Journal & Country Rank	https://www.scimagojr.com/index.php

IV Appendix

1 Statement of the University in Response to the Expert Report

We fully agree about the importance of updating the reference literature at course level on an annual basis. In 2020-2021, the following literature was bought for the study programs under accreditation:

Economics

№	The name of the textbook, manual	Place of publication, publisher and year of publication
1.	Comprehensive provision of financial and economic security of the state: textbook / M.I. Karlin	Kyiv: Condor, 2020
2.	Regional economy in modernization format: textbook / M.P. Butko, O.V. Popelo, O.D. Khomyk, O.M. Shevchenko; general ed. M. P. Butko	Kyiv: TsUL, 2020
3.	Economics of trade: textbook / N.O. Vlasova, V.A. Grosul, N.S. Krasnokutskaya, O.A. Kruglova	Kharkiv: Svit Knyh, 2021
4.	Organization of production: textbook / V.V. Kozyk, A.S. Gavryliak, T.O. Petrushka	Lviv: Lviv Polytechnic Publishing House, 2020
5.	Information business: textbook / Y.I. Palekha, Y.I. Horban	Kyiv: Lira-K, 2021
6.	Evaluation of business and its components: textbook / E.I. Tsybul'ska	Kyiv: Kondor, 2020
7.	Commodity science of food products: textbook / I.V. Syrokhman	Kharkiv: Svit Knyh, 2020
8.	Commodity science of non-food products: textbook / L.O. Radchenko, L.D. Liovshyna, M.P. Holovko, O.V. Miachykov	Kharkiv: Svit Knyh, 2021

Management

№	The name of the textbook, manual	Place of publication, publisher and year of publication
1.	Strategic management: textbook / M.M. Budnik, G.S. Nevertiy, N.M. Kurylova	Kyiv: Kondor, 2020
2.	Management of organizations: theory and practice: textbook / M.P. Malska, S.V. Bilous	Kyiv: Sladkevych B. A., 2020
3.	Management of the tourist industry: a textbook / O.M. Bilousov, O.E. Luhinin, O.S. Morozova, L.V. Sokolova	Kherson: Helvetyka, 2020
4.	Social responsibility: practical aspect: textbook / O.E.	Kyiv: Kondor, 2020



IV Appendix

1 Statement of the University in Response to the Expert Report

	Kuzmin, O.V. Pyroh, L.I. Chernobay, N.S. Stanasyuk	
5.	Financial management: textbook / E.I. Tsybulska	Kyiv: Kondor, 2021

Tourism

№ n/n	The name of the textbook, manual	Place of publication, publisher and year of publication
1.	Specialized tourism: textbook / O.V. Borysova	Kyiv: Kondor, 2020
2.	Rural green tourism: textbook /G.I. Gaponenko, A.Y. Parfinenko, I.M. Shamara	Sumy: University book, 2020
3.	Economics of tourism: textbook / V.G. Granovska, V.M. Krikunova, O.S. Morozova, Y.V. Katsemir	Kherson: OLDI-PLUS, 2021
4.	History of tourism: textbook / S.I. Lyman, A.Y. Parfinenko, I.S. Posokhov	Sumy: University book, 2020
5.	Organization of hotel and restaurant business: textbook / V.Ya. Brych, I.O. Baneva, M.Yu. Barna, T.I. Bozhuk; ed. V. Ya. Brych	Kyiv: Lira-K, 2020
6.	Fundamentals of tourism: textbook / O.A. Kruchek, S.F. Solyanyk, O.V. Parubets, S.I. Gordienko	Kherson: OLDI-PLUS, 2020
7.	Marketing of sustainable tourism: textbook / I.G. Smyrnov, O.O. Lyubitseva	Kyiv: Lira-K, 2020
8.	Tourist country study: textbook / V.I. Stafiyuchuk, O.Y. Malinovska	Kherson: OLDI-PLUS, 2020
9.	Management of the tourist industry: a textbook / O.M. Bilousov, O.E. Luginin, O.S. Morozova, L.V. Sokolova	Kherson: Helvetyka, 2020
10.	The organization of food and service of tourists at the enterprises of restaurant economy: textbook / O.V. Novikova, L.O. Radchenko, K.P. Vinichenko, P.P. Pyvovarov	Kharkiv: Svit Knyh, 2021

The recommendation to use a uniform questionnaire design for course evaluations and graduate surveys, as well as ensuring that the results of course evaluations are made known to the students will be used next academic year when preparing and implementing an updated system of collecting students' feedbacks. Since this academic year, the CPNU is a participant of the BUP project on improving university procedures and it is planned to involve foreign experts for the improvement of quality assurance at the university, including the system of surveys and questioners.

IV Appendix

1 Statement of the University in Response to the Expert Report

Next, we would like to outline several changes that have been made to the study programs so far.

In accordance with the recommendations, the educational program “**Tourism**” of the second master's level was revised. In particular, the elective courses were included in the curriculum: “Tourism Policy of Foreign Countries”, “Event Management in Tourism”, “Strategic Management and Marketing in Tourism”, “Tourism Ideology”, “Management of Sustainable Tourism Development”, “HR- management in the tourism industry”. The list of literature on the disciplines taught in the master's program has been updated. An application for licensed specialized software “Overia-Tourism” has been submitted.

Within the course “Quality management and projects in tourism”, the content of the work program has been updated: expanded the study of methods of ensuring and assessing the quality of tourist services based on world experience; emphasis is placed on the procedures of certification of tourist services.

Within the course “Innovative technologies in tourism”, a lecture on “Information technologies in tourism” is included and new topics of practical work are introduced:

Practical work № 1. Introduction of mobile applications for smartphones in the field of tourism business.

Practical work № 2. The use of contextual advertising in tourism.

Practical work № 3. Fundamentals of copywriting in tourism.

Practical work № 4. Using Google Ads in travel advertising.

Practical work № 5. Directions of use of QR-codes in tourist activity.

Practical work № 6. Scientific bases of formation of tourist brands.

Practical work № 7. Directions of development of startups in tourism.

The case is offered for independent work: Business in tourism: 25 alternative business ideas in the field of tourism.

In terms of internationalization of the educational process, applications are being prepared for the competitive selection of students for study at the University of Maribor (Slovenia) within the framework of the Erasmus + academic mobility program for the 2021-2022 academic year.

Moreover, the Department of Tourism has the following plans:

- from the 2021-2022 academic year, teach in English the courses “Rural Tourism” and “International Tourism” ;
- purchase the licensed ArcGIS program.

As for recommendations for the study program “**Economics**”, we agree that Game theory should be included in the curriculum and would like to point out that the compulsory course “Modeling and forecasting the development of socio-economic systems” includes a module “Game Theory”.

IV Appendix

1 Statement of the University in Response to the Expert Report

The recommendation on awarding credit points for the submission of the PhD-thesis and for its oral defense will be discussed by the support group and stakeholders, after which the appropriate changes will be submitted to the Academic Council of the University.

The developed educational and methodical materials of the study program Economics (bachelor level) for 2021-2022 take into account international experience and recommend the use of modern sources of world economic theory and practice. Also, there are amendments made in the curriculum to focus on business economics.

The course “Environmental Economics” is included in the list of compulsory disciplines for bachelors (8 semester).

Environmental aspects of socially responsible entrepreneurship are taken into account in the mandatory course “Environmental Economics”. The social aspects of responsible business and good business conduct are disclosed in the compulsory course “Organization of economic activity”.

The curriculum includes the compulsory course “Economic Forecasting” (7th semester), which contains the module “Cost Management”.

As for the Start-up training course, it was included in the compulsory block of the bachelor's degree program based on numerous offers from stakeholders (primarily employers and graduates). In case of decrease in the demand for competencies received by applicants under this course, it is possible to transfer this discipline to the elective ones.

The recommendation on awarding credit points for the submission of the PhD-thesis and for its oral defense was also given to the study program **Management**, so this question will be also discussed by the support group and stakeholders at the Department of Management and Civil Service, after which the appropriate changes will be submitted to the Academic Council of the University.

We are thankful to the Central Evaluation and Accreditation Agency and Expert Panel for thoughtful analysis of our study programs under accreditation, that made us review current approaches to the educational process at the university in general and has resulted in a number of initiatives that are being prepared now and will be soon implemented.

Yours faithfully,

Oleh Novomlynets

Rector of Chernihiv Polytechnic National University